

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA
ATLANTA DIVISION

IN RE: PARAGARD PRODUCTS	:	MDL <u>DOCKET NO. 2974</u>
LIABILITY LITIGATION	:	
	:	
This document relates to:	:	1:20-md-02974-LMM
	:	
BETTY FRANGELLA	:	
	:	
	:	Civil Action No.: _____
	:	
vs.	:	
TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA, INC.;	:	
TEVA WOMEN'S HEALTH, LLC; TEVA	:	
BRANDED PHARMACEUTICAL PRODUCTS	:	
R&D, INC.; THE COOPER COMPANIES,	:	
INC.; COOPERSURGICAL, INC.	:	

SHORT FORM COMPLAINT

Come(s) now the Plaintiff(s) named below, and for her/their Complaint against the Defendant(s) named below, incorporate(s) the Second Amended Master Personal Injury Complaint (Doc. No. 79), in MDL No. 2974 by reference.

Plaintiff(s) further plead(s) as follows:

1. Name of Plaintiff placed with Paragard: BETTY FRANGELLA

2. Name of Plaintiff's Spouse (if a party to the case): N/A

3. If case is brought in a representative capacity, Name of Other Plaintiff and capacity (i.e., administrator, executor, guardian, conservator):

N/A

4. State of Residence of each Plaintiff (including any Plaintiff in a representative capacity) at time of filing of Plaintiff's original complaint: Illinois
-

5. State of Residence of each Plaintiff at the time of Paragard placement: Illinois
-

6. State of Residence of each Plaintiff at the time of Paragard removal: Illinois
-

7. District Court and Division in which personal jurisdiction and venue would be proper: Northern District of Illinois - Eastern Division (Chicago)
-

8. Defendants. (Check one or more of the following five (5) Defendants against whom Plaintiff's Complaint is made. The following five (5) Defendants are the only defendants against whom a Short Form Complaint may be filed. No other entity may be added as a defendant in a Short Form Complaint.):

- A. Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.
- B. Teva Women’s Health, LLC
- C. Teva Branded Pharmaceutical Products R&D, Inc.
- D. The Cooper Companies, Inc.
- E. CooperSurgical, Inc.

9. Basis of Jurisdiction

- Diversity of Citizenship ([28 U.S.C. § 1332\(a\)](#))
- Other (if Other, identify below):

10.

Date(s) Plaintiff had Paragard placed (DD/MM/YYYY)	Placing Physician(s) or other Health Care Provider (include City and State)	Date Plaintiff’s Paragard was Removed (DD/MM/YYYY)* *If multiple removal(s) or attempted removal procedures, list date of each separately.	Removal Physician(s) or other Health Care Provider (include City and State)** **If multiple removal(s) or attempted removal procedures, list information separately.
2012	Daniel Rostein, MD Oak Brook, IL	4/22/2025 5/15/2025	Azita Ardakani, MD La Grange, IL

11. Plaintiff alleges breakage (other than thread or string breakage) of her Paragard upon removal.

Yes

No

12. Brief statement of injury(ies) Plaintiff is claiming:

Arm of IUD broke off during the initial removal attempt and remained imbedded.

This required a subsequent hysteroscopy, dilation and curettage to remove the imbedded arm.

Plaintiff reserves her right to allege additional injuries and complications specific to her.

13. Product Identification:

a. Lot Number of Paragard placed in Plaintiff (if now known):

Unknown

b. Did you obtain your Paragard from anyone other than the HealthCare Provider who placed your Paragard:

Yes

No

14. Counts in the Master Complaint brought by Plaintiff(s):

Count I – Strict Liability / Design Defect

Count II – Strict Liability / Failure to Warn

Count III – Strict Liability / Manufacturing Defect

Count IV – Negligence

Count V – Negligence / Design and Manufacturing Defect

Count VI – Negligence / Failure to Warn

- Count IX – Negligent Misrepresentation
 - Count X – Breach of Express Warranty
 - Count XI – Breach of Implied Warranty
 - Count XII – Violation of Consumer Protection Laws
 - Count XIII – Gross Negligence
 - Count XIV – Unjust Enrichment
 - Count XV – Punitive Damages
 - Count XVI – Loss of Consortium
 - Other Count(s) (Please state factual and legal basis for other claims not included in the Master Complaint below):
-
-

15. “Tolling/Fraudulent Concealment” allegations:

a. Is Plaintiff alleging “Tolling/Fraudulent Concealment”?

- Yes
- No

b. If Plaintiff is alleging “tolling/fraudulent concealment” beyond the facts alleged in the Master Complaint, please state the facts and legal basis applicable to the Plaintiff in support of those allegations below:

The nature of Plaintiff’s injuries and damages and their relation to the Plaintiff’s ParaGard IUD and Defendants’

wrongful conduct was not discovered and could not have been discovered, until a date within the applicable statute of limitations

16. Count VII (Fraud & Deceit) and Count VIII (Fraud by Omission) allegations:

a. Is Plaintiff is bringing a claim under Count VII (Fraud & Deceit), Count VIII (Fraud by Omission), and/or any other claim for fraud or misrepresentation?



Yes



No

b. If Yes, the following information must be provided (in accordance with Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 8 and/or 9, and/or with pleading requirements applicable to Plaintiff's state law claims):

i. The alleged statement(s) of material fact that Plaintiff alleges was false: Paragard was safe for use as a means of long term birth control and was as safe or

safer than other products on the market. Failure to disclose the product is prone to break during removal.

ii. Who allegedly made the statement: Defendants through their employees
(including sales representatives), marketing materials, and other communications.

iii. To whom the statement was allegedly made: Plaintiff and her
healthcare provider.

iv. The date(s) on which the statement was allegedly made:
Various dates since approval by the FDA in 1984. Both prior to and after Plaintiff's implant.

17. If Plaintiff is bringing any claim for manufacturing defect and alleging facts beyond those contained in the Master Complaint, the following information must be provided:

a. What does Plaintiff allege is the manufacturing defect in her Paragard? _____

18. Plaintiff's demand for the relief sought if different than what is alleged in the Master Complaint: _____

19. Jury Demand:

- Jury Trial is demanded as to all counts
 Jury Trial is NOT demanded as to any count

s/ Christopher Oxx
Attorney(s) for Plaintiff

Address, phone number, email address and Bar information:

Christopher Oxx (NY Bar #5208590)

6 Harbor Park Drive

Port Washington, NY 11050

oxx@yourlawyer.com

The JS44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket record. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ATTACHED)

I. (a) PLAINTIFF(S)

BETTY FRANGELLA

DEFENDANT(S)

TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS USA, INC.; TEVA WOMEN'S HEALTH, LLC; TEVA BRANDED PHARMACEUTICAL PRODUCTS R&D, INC.; THE COOPER COMPANIES, INC.; COOPERSURGICAL, INC.

(b) COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF

Cook CO., IL
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)

COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED DEFENDANT

Montgomery CO., PA
(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)

NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED

(c) ATTORNEYS (FIRM NAME, ADDRESS, TELEPHONE NUMBER, AND E-MAIL ADDRESS)

Christopher Oxx, Parker Waichman, LLP
6 Harbor Park Drive
Port Washington, NY 11050
(516) 466-6500
oxx@yourlawyer.com

ATTORNEYS (IF KNOWN)

II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION

(PLACE AN "X" IN ONE BOX ONLY)

- 1 U.S. GOVERNMENT PLAINTIFF
- 2 U.S. GOVERNMENT DEFENDANT
- 3 FEDERAL QUESTION (U.S. GOVERNMENT NOT A PARTY)
- 4 DIVERSITY (INDICATE CITIZENSHIP OF PARTIES IN ITEM III)

III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES

(PLACE AN "X" IN ONE BOX FOR PLAINTIFF AND ONE BOX FOR DEFENDANT) (FOR DIVERSITY CASES ONLY)

- | | | | | | |
|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|---|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|
| PLF | DEF | | PLF | DEF | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | <input type="checkbox"/> 1 | CITIZEN OF THIS STATE | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 | <input type="checkbox"/> 4 | INCORPORATED OR PRINCIPAL PLACE OF BUSINESS IN THIS STATE |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 2 | <input type="checkbox"/> 2 | CITIZEN OF ANOTHER STATE | <input type="checkbox"/> 5 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5 | INCORPORATED AND PRINCIPAL PLACE OF BUSINESS IN ANOTHER STATE |
| <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | <input type="checkbox"/> 3 | CITIZEN OR SUBJECT OF A FOREIGN COUNTRY | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 | <input type="checkbox"/> 6 | FOREIGN NATION |

IV. ORIGIN

(PLACE AN "X" IN ONE BOX ONLY)

- 1 ORIGINAL PROCEEDING
- 2 REMOVED FROM STATE COURT
- 3 REMANDED FROM APPELLATE COURT
- 4 REINSTATED OR REOPENED
- 5 TRANSFERRED FROM ANOTHER DISTRICT (Specify District)
- 6 MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION - TRANSFER
- 7 APPEAL TO DISTRICT JUDGE FROM MAGISTRATE JUDGE JUDGMENT
- 8 MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION - DIRECT FILE

V. CAUSE OF ACTION

(CITE THE U.S. CIVIL STATUTE UNDER WHICH YOU ARE FILING AND WRITE A BRIEF STATEMENT OF CAUSE - DO NOT CITE JURISDICTIONAL STATUTES UNLESS DIVERSITY)

28 U.S.C. 1332; Personal injury products liability

(IF COMPLEX, CHECK REASON BELOW)

- 1. Unusually large number of parties.
- 2. Unusually large number of claims or defenses.
- 3. Factual issues are exceptionally complex.
- 4. Greater than normal volume of evidence.
- 5. Extended discovery period is needed.
- 6. Problems locating or preserving evidence.
- 7. Pending parallel investigations or actions by government.
- 8. Multiple use of experts.
- 9. Need for discovery outside United States boundaries.
- 0. Existence of highly technical issues and proof.

CONTINUED ON REVERSE

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

RECEIPT # _____ AMOUNT \$ _____ APPLYING IFP _____ MAG. JUDGE (IFP) _____
 JUDGE _____ MAG. JUDGE _____ (Referral) NATURE OF SUIT _____ CAUSE OF ACTION _____

VI. NATURE OF SUIT (PLACE AN "X" IN ONE BOX ONLY)

CONTRACT - "0" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 150 RECOVERY OF OVERPAYMENT & ENFORCEMENT OF JUDGMENT
- 152 RECOVERY OF DEFAULTED STUDENT LOANS (Excl. Veterans)
- 153 RECOVERY OF OVERPAYMENT OF VETERAN'S BENEFITS

CONTRACT - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 110 INSURANCE
- 120 MARINE
- 130 MILLER ACT
- 140 NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENT
- 151 MEDICARE ACT
- 160 STOCKHOLDERS' SUITS
- 190 OTHER CONTRACT
- 195 CONTRACT PRODUCT LIABILITY
- 196 FRANCHISE

REAL PROPERTY - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 210 LAND CONDEMNATION
- 220 FORECLOSURE
- 230 RENT LEASE & EJECTMENT
- 240 TORTS TO LAND
- 245 TORT PRODUCT LIABILITY
- 290 ALL OTHER REAL PROPERTY

TORTS - PERSONAL INJURY - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 310 AIRPLANE
- 315 AIRPLANE PRODUCT LIABILITY
- 320 ASSAULT, LIBEL & SLANDER
- 330 FEDERAL EMPLOYERS' LIABILITY
- 340 MARINE
- 345 MARINE PRODUCT LIABILITY
- 350 MOTOR VEHICLE
- 355 MOTOR VEHICLE PRODUCT LIABILITY
- 360 OTHER PERSONAL INJURY
- 362 PERSONAL INJURY - MEDICAL MALPRACTICE
- 365 PERSONAL INJURY - PRODUCT LIABILITY
- 367 PERSONAL INJURY - HEALTH CARE/ PHARMACEUTICAL PRODUCT LIABILITY
- 368 ASBESTOS PERSONAL INJURY PRODUCT LIABILITY

TORTS - PERSONAL PROPERTY - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 370 OTHER FRAUD
- 371 TRUTH IN LENDING
- 380 OTHER PERSONAL PROPERTY DAMAGE
- 385 PROPERTY DAMAGE PRODUCT LIABILITY

BANKRUPTCY - "0" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 422 APPEAL 28 USC 158
- 423 WITHDRAWAL 28 USC 157

CIVIL RIGHTS - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 440 OTHER CIVIL RIGHTS
- 441 VOTING
- 442 EMPLOYMENT
- 443 HOUSING/ ACCOMMODATIONS
- 445 AMERICANS with DISABILITIES - Employment
- 446 AMERICANS with DISABILITIES - Other
- 448 EDUCATION

IMMIGRATION - "0" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 462 NATURALIZATION APPLICATION
- 465 OTHER IMMIGRATION ACTIONS

PRISONER PETITIONS - "0" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 463 HABEAS CORPUS- Alien Detainee
- 510 MOTIONS TO VACATE SENTENCE
- 530 HABEAS CORPUS
- 535 HABEAS CORPUS DEATH PENALTY
- 540 MANDAMUS & OTHER
- 550 CIVIL RIGHTS - Filed Pro se
- 555 PRISON CONDITION(S) - Filed Pro se
- 560 CIVIL DETAINEE: CONDITIONS OF CONFINEMENT

PRISONER PETITIONS - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 550 CIVIL RIGHTS - Filed by Counsel
- 555 PRISON CONDITION(S) - Filed by Counsel

FORFEITURE/PENALTY - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 625 DRUG RELATED SEIZURE OF PROPERTY 21 USC 881
- 690 OTHER

LABOR - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 710 FAIR LABOR STANDARDS ACT
- 720 LABOR/MGMT. RELATIONS
- 740 RAILWAY LABOR ACT
- 751 FAMILY and MEDICAL LEAVE ACT
- 790 OTHER LABOR LITIGATION
- 791 EMPL. RET. INC. SECURITY ACT

PROPERTY RIGHTS - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 820 COPYRIGHTS
- 840 TRADEMARK
- 880 DEFEND TRADE SECRETS ACT OF 2016 (DTSA)

PROPERTY RIGHTS - "8" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 830 PATENT
- 835 PATENT-ABBREVIATED NEW DRUG APPLICATIONS (ANDA) - a/k/a Hatch-Waxman cases

SOCIAL SECURITY - "0" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 861 HIA (1395f)
- 862 BLACK LUNG (923)
- 863 DIWC (405(g))
- 863 DIWW (405(g))
- 864 SSID TITLE XVI
- 865 RSI (405(g))

FEDERAL TAX SUITS - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 870 TAXES (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant)
- 871 IRS - THIRD PARTY 26 USC 7609

OTHER STATUTES - "4" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 375 FALSE CLAIMS ACT
- 376 Qui Tam 31 USC 3729(a)
- 400 STATE REAPPORTIONMENT
- 430 BANKS AND BANKING
- 450 COMMERCE/ICC RATES/ETC.
- 460 DEPORTATION
- 470 RACKETEER INFLUENCED AND CORRUPT ORGANIZATIONS
- 480 CONSUMER CREDIT
- 485 TELEPHONE CONSUMER PROTECTION ACT
- 490 CABLE/SATELLITE TV
- 890 OTHER STATUTORY ACTIONS
- 891 AGRICULTURAL ACTS
- 893 ENVIRONMENTAL MATTERS
- 895 FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT 899
- 899 ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES ACT / REVIEW OR APPEAL OF AGENCY DECISION
- 950 CONSTITUTIONALITY OF STATE STATUTES

OTHER STATUTES - "8" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 410 ANTITRUST
- 850 SECURITIES / COMMODITIES / EXCHANGE

OTHER STATUTES - "0" MONTHS DISCOVERY TRACK

- 896 ARBITRATION (Confirm / Vacate / Order / Modify)

PLEASE NOTE DISCOVERY TRACK FOR EACH CASE TYPE. SEE LOCAL RULE 26.3

VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:

CHECK IF CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.Civ.P. 23 DEMAND \$ 75,001

JURY DEMAND YES NO (CHECK YES ONLY IF DEMANDED IN COMPLAINT)

VIII. RELATED/REFILED CASE(S) IF ANY

JUDGE Hon. Leigh Martin May DOCKET NO. 1:20-md-02974-LMM

CIVIL CASES ARE DEEMED RELATED IF THE PENDING CASE INVOLVES: (CHECK APPROPRIATE BOX)

- 1. PROPERTY INCLUDED IN AN EARLIER NUMBERED PENDING SUIT.
- 2. SAME ISSUE OF FACT OR ARISES OUT OF THE SAME EVENT OR TRANSACTION INCLUDED IN AN EARLIER NUMBERED PENDING SUIT.
- 3. VALIDITY OR INFRINGEMENT OF THE SAME PATENT, COPYRIGHT OR TRADEMARK INCLUDED IN AN EARLIER NUMBERED PENDING SUIT.
- 4. APPEALS ARISING OUT OF THE SAME BANKRUPTCY CASE AND ANY CASE RELATED THERETO WHICH HAVE BEEN DECIDED BY THE SAME BANKRUPTCY JUDGE.
- 5. REPETITIVE CASES FILED BY PRO SE LITIGANTS.
- 6. COMPANION OR RELATED CASE TO CASE(S) BEING SIMULTANEOUSLY FILED (INCLUDE ABBREVIATED STYLE OF OTHER CASE(S)):

7. EITHER SAME OR ALL OF THE PARTIES AND ISSUES IN THIS CASE WERE PREVIOUSLY INVOLVED IN CASE NO. _____, WHICH WAS DISMISSED. This case IS IS NOT (check one box) SUBSTANTIALLY THE SAME CASE.

/s/ Christopher Oxx

January 6, 2025

SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD

DATE